

**NORTH RIDGEVILLE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
MINUTES OF
REGULAR MEETING MAY 16, 2017**

To Order: The meeting was called to order at 6:30 P.M.

Roll Call: Present were Members Nick Ciofani and Chairman James Yost.
Also present were Assistant Law Director Toni Morgan and Recording Secretary Donna Tjotjos, Lieutenant Laborie, Lieutenant Cook, Lieutenant Chad Warner and Stacey Berkley, City of North Olmsted. Lieutenant Dan Rogers arrived at 6:48 P.M.

Minutes:

It was moved by Ciofani and seconded by Yost to approve the regular meeting minutes dated April 18, 2017 as submitted.

MOTION CARRIED

Chairman Yost noted that he will not be in attendance for the next regular meeting dated June 20, 2017.

Recording Secretary Tjotjos stated she also will not be in attendance. She noted that there will not be a quorum unless a new member is appointed prior to the next regular meeting.

Reports:

Calendar of Events was noted as received

Patrolman Entrance Exam Results was noted as received

Status of Protest period for Patrolman Entrance Written Exam was discussed and noted that there were no protests received.

Unfinished Business:

New Business:

Chairman Yost noted that on the agenda is the request to certify additional names provided to Fire Chief due to names that were removed from the current certified list.

It was moved by Yost and seconded by Ciofani to certify additional names from the Fire Entrance Eligibility List as presented.

MOTION CARRIED

Chairman Yost noted receipt of a letter dated 5/9/17 from candidate Edward Gawlik challenging the Patrolman Entrance Agility exam held April 22, 2017.

Assistant Law Director Morgan suggested that the Commission move into Executive Session to discuss this topic.

It was moved by Yost and seconded by Ciofani to go into Executive Session to discuss the challenge presented.

MOTION CARRIED

Adjourned to Executive Session at 6:38 P.M.

Resumed the meeting at 6:42 P.M.

Chairman Yost stated after checking into this, the responsible party being the Police Department will be correcting this in the favor of the candidate.

It was moved by Yost and seconded by Ciofani to approve the Challenge.

MOTION CARRIED

Chairman Yost stated that is all that is on the agenda tonight and asked if the Fire staff had any questions on the other testing.

Lieutenant Cook stated something should have been on the agenda. He explained on March 27 when the Commission made the announcements for the promotional exam, he got called away during the meeting and the Chairman and Secretary were nice enough to stick around afterwards to provide him with his results. Once he found out his results, he asked specifically if anything was given from PRADCO as far as a summary because they were all under the assumption that the City paid extra for an evaluation, a summary to be printed off. He was told that no, it was just the scores. Fast forward to the next meeting, which was on the 18th and he didn't end up reading the minutes until the 19th of April where the minutes say that the Commission questioned Lieutenant Laborie about whether or not there were any summary of how they did. He had mentioned the check off sheet that they all received, but the check sheet he was describing was only a portion of the exam. He didn't know it until he read the minutes on the 20th that was in fact a summary sent with the scores and so the following day on the 21st he went to the Secretary's office and he inquired about it and we had a discussion. She said she was going to get back to him. She did not. She also said she would add this to the agenda and she did not. They are here to ask for those summaries because they have been given out before. Captain Rogers who hasn't been promoted yet, but he did receive a summary from the last test given. He also has read other summaries from PRADCO. Basically, they are here because they want to know how they did to

explain their scores to see where they can improve. Otherwise, they didn't get anything out of it. They just took a personality exam and they were given an arbitrary score. That is why they are here to ask for those summaries.

Chairman Yost stated he didn't know what summaries have come back. He asked if Toni Morgan could explain.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated it isn't something she has personally seen but she has an understanding that we get something else back. What she has to look at is to talk to the testing company, look at the test integrity and look at whether or not this would help anybody or hurt anybody overall. The Commission is by law the test giver. They want to remain above everything and remain completely unbiased and so that is what they have to look at. Our job is not to help people study and so, it is something they will look at and she will get an answer.

Lieutenant Cook stated just so they know, this is something that the Commission has sent out before; as little as last year.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated she is unaware of that.

Lieutenant Cook stated this is about them, their personalities. It has nothing to do with studying or whatever.

Chairman Yost stated this is an assessment.

Lieutenant Cook stated that this is the assessment center and it has nothing to do with the test.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated that would lead her to believe that you can't change your personality. She didn't know how it would be helpful at all. However, that isn't going to stop her from looking into it.

Lieutenant Cook agreed that you cannot change your personality, but there is a summary and as far as he knows and what they have been told as he is sure he will get support from the others that they were told they were to get a summary and that this is supposed to be used....

Assistant Law Director Morgan asked if they were told they were supposed to get it.

Lieutenant Cook stated absolutely.

Assistant Law Director Morgan asked by whom as she is unaware of this so she doesn't

know.

Lieutenant Cook stated he could go back to the minutes.

Lieutenant Warner stated that the gentleman that gave his PRADCO test said that the City had requested and had paid additional monies for a summary to be handed out to them so they can understand where they ranked.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated she will look into it.

Lieutenant Laborie showed the summary that they did receive.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated she doesn't know what they receive, she doesn't look at that herself, but from what is being stated is the first time that she has heard it.

Assistant Law Director Morgan addressed Lieutenant Chad Warner and asked if he remembered who it was that he spoke with.

Lieutenant Warner stated he did not remember but it was one of the testing individuals.

Chairman Yost stated that will be found out and we will get an explanation.

Lieutenant Laborie stated that another reason he is here tonight other than to be supportive of both of these gentlemen is that he has some corrections that need to be made to the minutes from 3/27.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated that isn't a function he can do and the Civil Service Commission has already approved those minutes.

Lieutenant Laborie stated this is an integrity based issue.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated the summary is just that, it is a summary of minutes. They are not word for word and it is not something for someone outside of the Commission to decide.

Lieutenant Laborie stated that it is in relation to PRADCO as well and as he said when he came in, he is done taking tests within the City, he is too close on the retirement edge and he has no dogs in this hunt anymore. He showed the summary he received and stated that is all they received.

Lieutenant Warner stated their concern is that they believe that all three of them received the same exact score from PRADCO and they are three very different individuals and so, what

they are trying to understand is how this test is based. What areas are they focusing on and how can three completely different individuals all obtain the same exact score.

Assistant Law Director Morgan spoke, but there were too many people talking at the same time.

Lieutenant Laborie stated nothing against Lieutenant Rogers, who is going to be promoted to Captain, but he took this exact same test a year ago; coincidentally scored the exact same thing on the personality exam. Tell him that doesn't raise a red flag with the Commission.

Chairman Yost asked if it was the same person giving his test.

Lieutenant Laborie stated he saw the same guy.

Lieutenant Cook stated no, actually he didn't.

Lieutenant Laborie stated he thought he said he did. Regardless, he still scored the exact same thing on the examination. There wasn't any kind of change at the PRADCO level. His concern is the future of the department with utilizing this system.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated that the question he seems to be raising will not be answered in terms of what she is looking at and she doesn't think there is a way to answer that question. You're basically saying that the test is no good and you want to challenge the whole thing.

Lieutenant Laborie stated he is not challenging the exam. He stated that he believes the best candidate as far as he can see was determined through the testing process.

Lieutenant Warner asked how they could then improve though if they don't know which areas to work on.

Lieutenant Laborie stated that the purpose in giving an evaluation is to cause improvement. When he sits down with his crew for an assessment and gives them an evaluation of their performance over the course of the last year, the purpose of that evaluation is so that they can improve their status as a firefighter/paramedic within this organization. When he attends a promotional evaluation, he would expect; as these guys all did as well, some sort of documentation other than this freaking check sheet that means nothing to him, that tells him how he can improve to being an asset to his organization.

Chairman Yost asked if there was a date on it and if there were names on it.

Lieutenant Laborie stated that his name is on it.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated that they will look into it and she will have an answer for them. That is all she can say at this point.

Chairman Yost apologized for taking this long.

Lieutenant Cook stated that is the way things go. It has been handed out in the past. Dan Rogers is on his way up to confirm this. He received an entire breakdown of the entire assessment. The check sheet that the Commission is looking at is based off of 300 plus questions under one section of the assessment. It wasn't the breakdown of the entire assessment which was what the City paid for and is what the City had given out to the Lieutenant candidates before.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated that they will look into it and they will get back to them. She stated that they will talk to the agency and will have the answers for them but they don't have any answers right now.

Lieutenant Cook stated that the Commission doesn't have them, but the minutes of...

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated answers to their questions; she does not have right now.

Lieutenant Cook asked if she had the assessments.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated she doesn't know the answer to that. She can assume that we do, but at any rate, this is something that has to be looked into.

Chairman Yost stated that Toni is charged with that responsibility now to get down to the right information from the testing agency. That sheet doesn't carry the weight in comparison to what is being described as few pages of written remarks. To him that would be a lot more valuable to see if this person is improving and that is what you want to see.

Lieutenant Cook stated that when you guys sat with him after the meeting that night, he was told nothing was given and then a month and a half later, he read that something was given by PRADCO.

Chairman Yost stated that they didn't know what was given.

Assistant Law Director Morgan asked if he had a date to those minutes he is referring to.

Lieutenant Cook stated that it was the meeting of March 27, 2017.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated she will look into it. She doesn't know the answer but she will definitely find it.

Member Ciofani stated that the Commission can also take a look at the invoice to see if they mention that too.

Lieutenant Cook stated that he was told that they were never handed out and thankfully, Mr. Rogers has showed up to tell us what he had received from his last promotional exam.

Lieutenant Dan Rogers stated that the candidates in the promotional exam were given a packet that contained roughly eight pages giving them pointers on things they scored poorly on and giving them praises for things they did well on. It provided strengths and weaknesses and areas you can work on and he thought it was a very valuable part of the examination because it gave him feedback and stuff he could work on.

Assistant Law Director Morgan asked who gave him that report and how long ago.

Lieutenant Rogers stated that it was a little over a year ago and his wife actually pulled it from the filing cabinet and she sent a copy to his phone. He believes he received it in the mail, but he doesn't recall. He provided a summary of what was included on that.

Assistant Law Director Morgan asked him to forward that to Donna.

Lieutenant Rogers said he could email it to his email and then forward it to Donna.

Lieutenant Laborie stated that is why they are all here so that it will help them in future examinations. This is why he wanted something hashed out from the minutes of March 27 and that is that it came across that he was singing great praises for PRADCO and what he was saying was that he was pleased that it was better than what they had in the past. He did not wish that to come across that they were the greatest thing since sliced bread because there were many flaws in this system. One thing in particular that he can mention off the top of his head is that this check sheet says that he is in need of self-improvement educationally. There are two fire officer three qualified in their department. He pointed at one of the fire staff and stated that guy and him. He is the third member of their department to be sent to the Ohio Fire Executive Course. He believes that qualifies for self-improvement as far as this goes, but that isn't reflected on a computerized check sheet that is looking over your personality. He stated that they don't even know what the control was for the test. He stated that the question is what they are being measured against. He didn't feel that being fair either, not knowing the standard before you go into any testing.

Secretary Tjotjos asked if PRADCO did not explain that before they walked in.

Lieutenant Laborie stated they did not.

Secretary Tjotjos stated that they did state that they provided that information.

Lieutenant Laborie stated that the computer test was sent to them and they took the test at home on their own time at their own pace and there were 380 to 400 questions.

Lieutenant Cook stated that was only one section of the exam.

Lieutenant Laborie stated that once they arrived at the testing site, there was still another 45 minutes of computerized testing there before they even went to the interviews. They spent close to four to five hours in front of a computer before they even sat down with a person who evaluated them with a check sheet. He stated that the least that is owed to them is a summary of how they came up with that.

Chairman Yost stated he isn't happy with that.

Lieutenant Rogers stated that was the basis of the oral interview as they go over the results from that because that all comes from the written part that you take at home and they then have the option of raising or marking off your scores so, that isn't actually included in your score, but it may be. It depends on how you answer their questions, which gives them a starter to dig into things to see how you really are.

Chairman Yost stated he believes that they have learned a little bit more tonight and as he has stated before, Civil Service is laymen to this thing. He couldn't begin to take a test that they have done let alone study for it diligently. He appreciated the help.

Lieutenant Rogers stated one of the things that he did like about PRADCO was the way that you got that feedback back and you were able to work on things. There are some things in there that he doesn't agree with. Every test may not be that valid but at least it gives you things to work on and reinforce the strong points.

Chairman Yost stated that things are changing and getting more complicated and it is hard to keep up. This might help us. He addressed Assistant Law Director Morgan and asked if she would dive into that.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated that she will.

Lieutenant Warner stated that there were multiple people giving the same test to all the candidates.

Lieutenant Cook stated that there were four different people giving the assessment to six

Lieutenants for this spot.

Lieutenant Warner stated that there is no consistency as far as that goes and you are getting opinions from four different individuals.

Secretary Tjotjos addressed Assistant Law Director Morgan and stated that she will give her the contact person at PRADCO.

Lieutenant Warner stated that they don't have any idea of how this test was based. What is the control and how are they basing their scores and their numbers on.

Lieutenant Cook stated not only that but where is the practicality in it.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated again, these are questions that they aren't going to be able to be answered here. This is not an uncommon test for people to take as they know.

Lieutenant Laborie stated for corporate. This is not IBM. This is North Ridgeville Fire.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated she will get all the answers to the questions that were raised.

Chairman Yost thanked the fire staff.

ADJOURNMENT:

Chairman Yost adjourned the meeting.

Secretary Tjotjos asked if the Commission wanted to schedule a special meeting to review and approve the eligibility list and to certify the top ten. She explained that the candidates are already calling in to find out their rank and where they fall on the eligibility list.

Chairman Yost asked if Toni would have anything ready for a special meeting.

Assistant Law Director Morgan stated she would have something ready for the next regular scheduled meeting not the special meeting.

The Commission member's availability was discussed and May 23, 2017 at 6:30 P.M. was agreed upon.

Secretary Tjotjos asked the Commission for direction regarding submitting a letter to the candidate who challenged the agility providing him with the results of his challenge.

**NORTH RIDGEVILLE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

MAY 16, 2017

PAGE 10

Chairman Yost stated please, that they have approved his challenge; the sooner the better. He then noted that as he read over the letters that were coming from him, with his name on it but he knows absolutely nothing about it until he opened the packet and looked at it.

Secretary Tjotjos asked which letter he was referring to.

Chairman Yost stated that there were two in the packet. He stated that he cannot do that or he will not do that anymore. He stated he has to know something about it.

Secretary Tjotjos stated that direction was provided during a meeting. She stated that direction was given for her to provide the information to those that failed. The other letter was the results of the exam and direction was given on that too. Those letters are templates and direction was given in order for those to go out. She stated that she doesn't arbitrarily send letters out without the direction of the Commission.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:13 P.M.

James P. Yost
Chairman

Anna Tjotjos
Recording Secretary

7/18/17
Date Approved